

**MINUTES
ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW COMMISSION
SPECIAL MEETING
TUESDAY MAY 31, 2022
6:30 P.M.**

The special meeting of the City of Newburgh Architectural Review Commission (“ARC”) was held on Tuesday, May 31, 2022 at 6:30 p.m. using Zoom videoconference. The special meeting was held for re-scheduled applications from the May 10, 2022 regular meeting, where there was not a quorum to conduct regular business.

Members Present: Michele Basch, Chairperson
Michael Buonanno
Carson Carter
Kate Flanagan
James Kelly
Gregory Nato

Reggie Young
Schnekwa McNeil (Alternate)

Absent: Chris Hanson

Also Present: Jeremy Kaufman, Assistant Corporation Counsel
J.K. Gentile, Secretary to the Land Use Boards

Meeting called to order at 6:45 p.m.

Minutes of the April 12, 2022 Meeting

The Chairperson moved to accept the minutes from the April 2022 ARC meeting.
Reggie Young seconded the motion.
The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

OLD BUSINESS

AR 2022-024

Applicant: 3 Fratelli / Ben Papaleo
Owner: 3 Fratelli
Location: 242 Broadway

Returning for determination to install new windows, repair/replace sills, install new lintels, repair/replace and paint cornice and fascia, install new wood panels, trim and paint, install new fascia and trim, paint wood rake and trim, repair/repoint and remove paint on masonry, install new store front, panel, trim and paint and install new shingles. Painting using colors from the Sherwin Williams Historic color palette.

Michael Papaleo and Ben Papaleo appeared before the Board.

Michael Papaleo gave an update and addressed the details requested at the April 2022 meeting.

Mr. Young asked the material of the doors for the street level doorways.

Michael Papaleo said fiberglass.

Mr. Buonanno asked if there would be a wood grain finish on the fiberglass.

Michael Papaleo said yes.

The Chairperson asked the applicant to confirm their decision to go with a fiberglass door.

Michael Papaleo said yes. Ben Papaleo explained that the fiberglass door is easier to maintain.

Mr. Kelly asked how much higher the storefront sign board was raised and asked for a comparison of the interior height of the drop ceiling to the sign board outside.

Michael Papaleo said the interior height of the drop ceiling has not been determined yet and the storefront sign board was reduced to 2.8 feet.

Ben Papaleo added the spandrel header covers the 18" beam that runs across the storefront.

Mr. Carter asked if the brick and stone material have been retained.

Ben Papaleo said they salvaged the brick, stone and windowsills. He said all of the salvaged items will be re-used and reincorporated into the rehab work.

Mr. Carter asked for the mortar specs.

Ben Papaleo said Type N lime mortar.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

The Chairperson moved for a conditional approval, subject to the following conditions:

- First floor ceiling shall be maintained at the original height
- All salvaged brick shall be reincorporated into the exterior facade
- Type N lime mortar shall be used for all masonry
- Brick used in the new construction (rear elevation) shall match original building brick to the best extent practicable.
- The entryway doors to the premises will be left open for consideration at a later meeting.

James Kelly seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2021-074

Applicant:	Colin Jarvis
Owner (17 Johnston):	City of Newburgh
Owner (19 Johnston):	The Newburgh Ministry, Inc.
Location:	17 Johnston Street and 19 Johnston Street

Returning for determination of new construction of a multi-story residential building.

James Kelly abstained from discussion and vote.

Colin Jarvis, Don Petruncola, Frank Cerbini and Lee Lasberg appeared before the Board.

Don Petruncola gave an overview of the updated stages of design as requested by the Board's review.

Mr. Petruncola presented renderings and three perspective elevation views.

Ms. Flanagan said, although not a problem, the height changes the visual landscape of the neighborhood.

Mr. Buonanno asked about the brick detailing above the main entrance.

Mr. Petruncola said they pulled details from the Ministry building and designed the brick to echo the rhythm of the rowhouses close to the property.

(Ms. McNeil left the meeting due to technical connection difficulties.)

Mr. Nato said the height of the building heading south on Johnston Street toward Broadway

presents a visual disconnect from the neighboring buildings.

Mr. Carter asked if the windows would have grids as shown on the renderings and asked what the window type is.

Mr. Petruncola said the windows will not have grids. The window specs proposed are Anderson 400 series aluminum clad wood window.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

Marcos Campos spoke in favor of the project.

Jeffrey Woody spoke in favor of the project.

Genesis Ramos spoke in favor of the project.

Judy Thomas spoke in favor of the project.

Ray Harvey spoke in favor of the project.

David Dendy spoke in favor of the project.

Inaudy Esposito spoke in favor of the project.

Melanie Collins spoke in favor of the project.

Noreen Krispin spoke in favor of the project.

Josiah Landers spoke in favor of the project.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

In response to comment made during the public hearing, the Chairperson said the ARC's duty is specifically regarding Historic District guidelines. The Chairperson said the purpose and use of the building, while admirable, is not eligible for consideration under the guidelines. The Chairperson clarified that no ARC members are against the use or purpose of the building, but those items unfortunately are not up for consideration by the Board.

Ms. Flanagan referred to page 23 of the guidelines regarding building height for new infill on or adjacent to Broadway. She said this building is taller than the immediate adjoining building to the north but is also close enough to Broadway to the south to support the larger scale.

The Chairperson moved to approve application as submitted, with the specific finding that the proposed building would not aesthetically overshadow or diminish the historic quality of the surrounding area, and subject to the following conditions:

- All windows shall be aluminum clad wood with no grills.

Reggie Young seconded the motion.

The motion passed 6-0 via roll-call vote.

AR 2022-035

Applicant: Chris Berg / Berg + Moss Architects
Owner: Randy McMurtrMie and Stephanie Bloomer
Location: 35 South Lander Street

Returning for determination to install sidewalks.

The City Engineering Department comment letter was made a matter of record.

Chris Berg and Randy McMurtrie appeared before the Board.

Mr. Berg gave a brief overview of the project for the new members of the Board. He highlighted proposed changes to the plan since last month. In response to the discussion of the Board last month, he said the applicant would like to install concrete sidewalks and concrete curbs. He said concrete curbs are typical of the area.

Mr. Carter agreed with the concrete sidewalk proposal. He referenced the City Engineer's letter indicating granite curbing installation performed by future work planned for a larger City project at this intersection and thinks granite curb installation is appropriate.

Mr. Nato agreed with concrete sidewalks and granite curbing.

Mr. Young agreed with concrete sidewalks and granite curbing.

Ms. Flanagan agreed with concrete sidewalks and granite curbing. She asked if the applicant is requesting a variance for the tree planting pits.

Mr. Buonanno agreed with concrete sidewalks and granite curbing.

Mr. Kelly agreed with concrete sidewalks and granite curbing.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

Judy Thomas spoke in support of concrete curbing.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

The Applicant requested tabling the application to seek further clarification from the City Engineer.

AR 2022-038

Applicant: Gibbons Engineering
Owner: Sarah Mekhail
Location: 31 Johnston Street

Returning for determination to install new windows, install new front door and paint using colors from the Benjamin Moore Historic color palette.

James Gibbons and Sarah Mekhail appeared before the Board.

Mr. Gibbons addressed the details requested at the April 2022 meeting.

Mr. Kelly said the bay window siding is not original to the building. He asked if they have looked at what is underneath the bay window siding.

Mr. Gibbons said he believes it was reconstructed to enclose the building in that area. He said the original material is not present.

Mr. Kelly said historically the windows in the bay would be the same height as the 2nd and 3rd floor front façade windows.

Mr. Young asked what happened to the chimneys.

Ms. Mekhail said she purchased the building as a complete shell: no roof and no floors. She said there was no way to retain the chimneys. Emergency restructuring had to be performed to ensure the building could stand the addition of a new roof and floors.

Mr. Carter asked if the chimney stack remained.

Ms. Mekhail said there was no chimney stack. Once they began removing the debris, the building began to collapse within itself.

The Chairperson requested more information regarding the bay windows and photographs of the non-existing chimney.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

Judy Thomas spoke in favor of the project.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

Mr. Carter asked if they would consider bringing back the window next to the front door, where a lintel remains.

Ms. Mekhail said that was originally another door, bricked up in the 1980s.

The Applicant requested tabling the application for additional information and photographs.

AR 2021-006

Applicant: Erik Cooney
Owner: 56 Chambers, LLC
Location: 56 Chambers Street

Returning for determination to install new windows.

James Kelly recused himself from vote.

James Kelly appeared before the Board and gave an update on the project.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

Kate Flanagan made a motion to accept the application as submitted.

The Chairperson seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2022-010

Applicant: Thaer Abuquare
Owner: Thaer Abuquare
Location: 14 Benkard Avenue

Returning for determination to replace windows, replace guard rail, install new lighting and paint using colors from the Benjamin Moore Historic color palette.

Thaer Abuquare appeared before the Board and addressed the details requested at the February 2022 ARC meeting.

Mr. Carter said 1/1 style windows would be historically accurate.

Mr. Kelly agreed.

Mr. Carter recommended using a lime mortar to repoint.

Mr. Abuquare agreed and added he will use a color that matches the original brick.

The Chairperson asked the applicant if the shelf under the front door window will be painted black.

Mr. Abuquare said yes.

The Chairperson recommended not to sand down the detail.

Mr. Abuquare agreed.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

No one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

Reggie Young moved to approve application as submitted, subject to the following conditions:

- All windows shall be aluminum clad, wood, 1/1 style with no removable grills.
- Soft lime mortar in classic Newburgh red (color) shall be used for all masonry.

Carson Carter seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

NEW BUSINESS

AR 2022-064

Applicant: John V. Waters
Owner: NFWM Newburgh LLC
Location: 136 S. Clark Street

Application to install new windows and front door, remove of existing paint on all brick, repoint brick, repaint of wood elements using colors from the Benjamin Moore Historic color palette

Sokol Binakaj and Kristine Magliano appeared before the Board.

Mr. Binakaj gave an overview of the proposed project.

Mr. Carter asked if the applicant would paint the cornice brackets a different color for variation.

Mr. Binakaj said that would be dependent on the owner's choice.

Mr. Kelly agreed with one color for the cornice.

Mr. Nato recommended two shades of the one color for some variation.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

Judy Thomas spoke in favor of the application and one color for the cornice and bracket.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

James Kelly moved to accept the application as submitted, subject to the following condition:

- Applicant has the option to select paint color for the cornice and brackets, provided the paint derives from the Benjamin Moore or Sherwin Williams historic color palette.

The Chairperson seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2022-065

Applicant: Safe Harbors of the Hudson, Inc. / Lisa Silverstone
Owner: Safe Harbors of the Hudson, Inc.
Location: 97-105 Ann Street

Application for ratification of sidewalk install.

Lisa Silverstone and Ramona Monteverde appeared before the Board.

The Assistant Corporation Counsel cautioned that Ms. Monteverde was appearing in her capacity as an employee with Safe Harbors and not as a City Councilperson. He said the ARC should draw no inferences one way or the other based on her appearance on behalf of the application.

Ms. Silverstone gave an overview of the project.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

Melanie Collins spoke in favor of the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

Carson Carter moved to accept the application as submitted and ratify the existing work performed.

James Kelly seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2022-066

Applicant: Gerald Brauer / Go Permits
Owner: Jeremy Parker and Carlos Aguilar Breton
Location: 23 Farrington Street

Application to install new windows.

Carlton Stone appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the proposed project.

The Chairperson asked if the windows will be 1/1 style.

Mr. Stone confirmed.

The Chairperson asked to confirm the windows as wood.

Mr. Stone said yes, Anderson 400 Series wood windows.

Mr. Carson asked if window labeled #18, which appears to be a 4-pane, wood, original window, be replaced.

Mr. Stone said all street facing windows will be replaced with 1/1 style, double hung window.

The Chairperson asked if the mansard window is original.

Mr. Stone said he is not sure.

Mr. Kelly agrees that window #18 appears to be original. He asked if the applicant would consider choosing a 2/2 style to maintain historic accuracy.

Mr. Stone agreed.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

The Applicant requested tabling the application for opportunity to submit window spec sheets for 2/2 style window.

AR 2022-067

Applicant: Berg + Moss Architects / Chris Berg
Owner: PDS OZ Holdings, LLC
Location: 50 South Miller Street

Application to install new front and rear door, install new lighting, restore/install new windows, install new front door trim, install new front stair risers and treads, repoint and repaint brick masonry, install new 1st floor rear deck and paint using colors from the Benjamin Moore Historic color palette.

Chris Berg appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the proposed project.

Mr. Kelly asked if the front entrance stairway extends into the building.

Mr. Berg confirmed.

Mr. Carter recommended retaining the arched windows.

Ms. Flanagan agreed.

Mr. Kelly said the rendering presents the 2nd floor windows as 2/1 style.

Mr. Berg said all the windows will be 2/2 style windows.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

The Chairperson moved to accept the application as submitted, subject to the following condition:

- All windows shall be Pella wood windows (per application submission), and all windows must be 2/2 style with no removable grills

James Kelly seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2022-068

Applicant: Berg + Moss Architects / Chris Berg
Owner: 47-49 Liberty LLC
Location: 47-49 Liberty Street

Application to install new storefronts, install new lighting, and paint using colors from the Benjamin Moore Historic color palette.

Chris Berg appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the proposed project.

Mr. Young asked the applicant if he intends to follow the line of the bay window extension out over the sidewalk.

Mr. Berg said the storefront will keep in plane with the building and the entrance will be recessed into the building.

Mr. Young about sidewalk depth.

Mr. Berg said less than 10 feet.

Mr. Nato asked about the floor covering plans for the transition from the sidewalk into the recessed entrance.

Mr. Berg said penny round or 1 + 1 tile.

Ms. Flanagan said this is a significant alteration to the existing structure. Removing the window and adding a storefront feature loses the historic character of the street. Referring to the Guidelines, she noted any new construction should be distinguished as different than the original construction.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

Judy Thomas spoke against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

The Applicant requested tabling the application for further submission.

AR 2022-069

Applicant: Berg + Moss Architects / Chris Berg
Owner: Newburgh SHG 82 LLC
Location: 74 Lander Street

Application to install new front door, frame & trim, install new windows, install new lighting, repoint and repaint masonry brick and paint using colors from the Benjamin Moore Historic color palette

Chris Berg appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the proposed project

Mr. Kelly asked about plans for paint removal.

Mr. Berg said to strip the loose paint and paint with latex paint.

Mr. Young said the double window on the first floor would not have historically been 4/4 style; they would have been 2/2 style, horizontal not vertical.

Mr. Carter requested that the historic street signs remain on the building. He said the chimney has lips that the rendering does not reflect and recommends maintaining intact. He said the Yankee Gutter trim piece that wraps around the corner is not reflected on the rendering and requested maintaining that detail.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

The Applicant requested tabling the application for further submission.

AR 2022-070

Applicant: Berg + Moss Architects / Chris Berg
Owner: 123-127 South William St. LLC
Location: 123-127 South William Street

Application to request ratification of installed fence

Chris Berg appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the project

Ms. Flanagan said the fence is flush against the sidewalk, over 40 inches from grade and is made of pressure treated wood.

The Chairperson said the fence appears to protect from a significant drop down off of the sidewalk.

Mr. Nato did not agree with painting the fence black.

Mr. Carter agreed.

The Chairperson agreed.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

Judy Thomas spoke in favor of the application.

Melanie Collins spoke in favor of the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

Carson Carter moved to accept the application as submitted, subject to the following condition:

- Fence shall be painted a color within the historic color palette, excluding any colors in the black or grey shade family.

The Chairperson seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2022-073

Applicant: LAN Associates E.P.A., LLP
Owner: Cornerstone Family Healthcare / David Jolly C.O.O
Location: 100 Broadway

Application to install egress staircase, install HV units, install new windows and remove existing chimneys.

Peter Manouvelos appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the proposed project.

The Chairperson asked why the chimneys need to be removed.

Mr. Manouvelos said they are in disrepair and not being used.

Mr. Carter said the chimney will help mitigate the site lines from the AC compressor units being placed on the roof.

Mr. Manouvelos said the chimneys towards the back are missing stone and brick, water is getting into the building and it is an obstacle to reconstruct.

Mr. Carter asked if that is true for all four chimneys.

Mr. Manouvelos said yes.

Mr. Young said the chimneys in the front of the building are prominent. He said the roof fence is also visible and asked if they could place the fence back and between the chimneys.

Mr. Manouvelos said they need to maintain 10 feet from the edge of the roof to the unit and currently it is placed right at that distance.

Mr. Young asked if the units are placed on steel dunnage.

Mr. Manouvelos said they are using steel curbs. The units must be a certain distance off the roof.

Mr. Kelly asked if there is another way to hide the units better.

Mr. Manouvelos said there is no way to hide the units better than what is proposed. He said they need the 3 units for the 3 floors and they have to follow Department of Health regulations in spacing the units out by a certain distance.

Mr. Kelly asked if they could use mini splits.

Mr. Manouvelos said no. He said they need certain CFM and there is no room to accommodate.

Mr. Kelly asked about the fencing.

Mr. Manouvelos said the fencing is collapsible.

Mr. Carter said this is a significant building on Broadway. He recommended maintaining the chimneys and using a collapsible fence.

Mr. Noto agreed and asked about the color of the fencing.

Mr. Manouvelos said galvanized grey.

Ms. Flanigan agreed with maintaining the chimneys and using a collapsible fence.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

The Applicant requested tabling the application for further submission.

AR 2022-074

Applicant: Christian Park
Owner: Christian Park
Location: 81 Nicoll Street

Application to install a walkway.

Applicant did not appear for the application.

The Board tabled the application.

AR 2022-075

Applicant: Michael Bonagura
Owner: Pedro Hinostraza
Location: 127 Chambers Street

Application to install new windows, install new lighting, repoint and repaint brick masonry, repair and restore window frames, cornice and fascia in kind and paint using colors from the Benjamin Moore Historic color palette.

Michael Bonagura appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the proposed project.

Mr. Carter recommended restoring the crown molding on the 2nd story windows.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

Carson Carter moved to accept the application as submitted, subject to the following condition:

- Crown molding above the 2nd story windows shall be retained and restored

The Chairperson seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2022-076

Applicant: Calderón Architecture & Design Studio, P.C.
Owner: Nicole Chung
Location: 162 South Street

Application to install new 1st and 2nd floor rear porches, install new front entrance steps, install new gate at front façade and install new cornice and brackets.

J.C. Calderon, Kevin Byrne and Nicole Chung appeared before the Board.

Mr. Calderon gave a brief overview of the scope of the project.

Mr. Byrne provided details of the proposed renovations.

Mr. Kelly requested additional details for the brick repointing, Yankee Gutter system, corbels and soffit and drawings for the back porch and front stoop.

Mr. Nato emphasized the importance of maintaining the original slate roof. He said comparing the cost of slate versus rubber is not as significant to what the cost would be to cut and fasten shingles on a roof of this size.

Mr. Carter requested a spec sheet for the basement window. He asked if the original stone steps could be restored for historic accuracy and in keeping with the neighboring properties. He requested a spec sheet for the garage doors. He requested a spec sheet on the rear porch doors.

Mr. Buonanno requested an elevation for the rear of the building.

Ms. Flanagan asked if the vestibule doors are still there.

Ms. Chung confirmed.

Ms. Flanagan said if they are planning on restoring both sets of doors, that detail should be added onto the plans.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

The Applicant requested tabling the application for further submission.

AR 2022-079

Applicant: JRK Restoration LLC / James R. Kelly
Owner: 74 Carson, LLC
Location: 74 Carson Avenue

Application to install new windows.

James Kelly recused himself from vote.

James Kelly appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the proposed project.

The Chairperson asked if the re-used windows fit the window openings for this building.

Mr. Kelly said all but the first floor. On the first floor, the window openings are taller.

Mr. Young said if the windows on the first floor do not fit it is not appropriate to use them.

Mr. Carter agreed.

Ms. Flanagan agreed and requested exploring other windows that will match for the first floor.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

The Applicant requested tabling the application for further submission.

AR 2022-080

Applicant: Erik Cooney
Owner: 188-194 Broadway, LLC
Location: 188 Broadway

Application to install new gate doors.

Erik Cooney appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the proposed project.

Ms. Flanagan asked if the height of the gate presented on the drawing resembles the existing.

Mr. Cooney confirmed

The Chairperson asked about the color and material of the gate.

Mr. Cooney said natural cedar.

Mr. Nato asked if there is an entry door within the two swinging gate doors.

Mr. Cooney confirmed, and the height of the full gate is the same as existing.

Ms. Flanagan asked about the blade sign.

Mr. Cooney said he will come back to the Board for approval at a later date for that detail.

Mr. Carter said the blade sign would obstruct the front steps of the neighboring home and there are inconsistencies with the height representation on the drawings.

Mr. Nato said the gate extends past the neighboring wall and column and asked if there is a way to construct the gate in line with the column.

Mr. Cooney said he could re-design to align the gate.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

Judy Thomas recommended recessing the gate behind the neighboring column and addressing the gate hardware.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

The Assistant Corporation Counsel asked if the gate swings onto the sidewalk.

Mr. Cooney said the gate swings inward.

The Applicant requested tabling the application for further submission.

With no further business to discuss, the meeting adjourned at 12:39 a.m.

Respectfully Submitted:

Approved:

J.K. Gentile, Secretary

Michele Basch, Chairperson