

MINUTES
ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW COMMISSION
Meeting of April 12, 2022

The monthly meeting of the City of Newburgh Architectural Review Commission (“ARC”) was held on Tuesday, April 12, 2022 at 6:30 p.m. using Zoom videoconference.

Members Present: Michele Basch, Chairperson
Kate Flanagan
Chris Hanson
James Kelly
Reggie Young

Also Present: Jeremy Kaufman, Assistant Corporation Counsel
J.K. Gentile, Secretary to the Land Use Boards

Meeting called to order at 6:35 p.m.

Minutes of the March 8, 2022 Meeting

James Kelly moved to accept the minutes from the March 2022 ARC meeting.
The Chairperson seconded the motion.
The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

CONSENT AGENDA

AR 2022-030

Applicant: Pinchos Mandel
Owner: Pinchos Mandel
Location: 295 Liberty Street

Application to paint using colors from the Benjamin Moore Historic color palette.

AR 2022-039

Applicant: Ronnie Maisonet
Owner: AAD Liberty Realty LLC
Location: 85 Liberty Street

Application to paint using colors from the Benjamin Moore Historic color palette.

AR 2022-032

Applicant: David A. Herring III
Owner: David A. Herring III
Location: 119 First Street

Application to paint using colors from the Benjamin Moore Historic color palette.

The Chairperson moved to approve the Consent Agenda as submitted.
Chris Hanson seconded the motion.
The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

OLD BUSINESS

AR 2021-100

Applicant: John Blesso
Owner: John Blesso
Location: 258 Montgomery Street

Returning for determination on mansard roof detail.

John Blesso appeared before the Board and addressed the mansard roof detail requested at the March 2022 meeting.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

The Chairperson moved to approve the balance of the application as submitted.
Chris Hanson seconded the motion.
The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2022-003

Applicant: John V. Waters
Owner: 353 Liberty LLC
Location: 353 Liberty Street

Returning for determination on the porch railing and baluster detail.

Matthew Cordone appeared before the Board and addressed the porch railing and baluster details requested at the March 2022 meeting.

Chris Hanson asked if they will put a cap on the newel post.

Mr. Cordone said yes, a flat, square profile cap.

Mr. Kelly asked about the stair tread material.

Mr. Cordone said painted hardwood; cedar or hemlock.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

The Chairperson moved to approve the balance of the application as submitted.

Chris Hanson seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2022-007

Applicant: Rashell Villa
Owner: Rashell Villa
Location: 52 Liberty Street WH

Returning for determination to install new windows, install new front entry door, repair siding and paint using colors from the Benjamin Moore Historic color palette.

Michael Henderson appeared before the Board and addressed the 3rd floor windows and front entrance details requested at the March 2022 meeting.

Mr. Young said the elevations lack detail, dimensions, close up photographs of what is currently existing, and profiles.

Mr. Young asked if the front entrance sidelights are being purchased or custom made.

Mr. Henderson said they will be purchased and asked if aluminum windows could be considered due to lack of supply.

Mr. Hanson said the project needs to continue with the clad wood windows.

The Chairperson agreed.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

Carson Carter commented on the chimney removal, the front entrance sidelights, the lack of eastern elevation plans and the installed driveway.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

The Chairperson said the rendering presents the front entrance sidelights appearing larger than what is existing.

Mr. Henderson said the front entrance sidelights will match the length of the sun room windows.

Mr. Kelly asked if they will keep round columns on the sun room or using pilaster columns as shown in the rendering.

Mr. Henderson said they will be round columns.

Mr. Hanson requested the driveway details and eastern elevation.

Mr. Young requested information regarding the chimney removal.

Mr. Kelly requested an elevation of the east side of the building.

The Applicant requested tabling the application for opportunity to submit further detail, including:

- eastern elevation
- driveway history, if available
- chimney history, if available
- detailed photographs and drawings of all building sides
- drawings that present accurate shapes, molds, and measurements

AR 2022-027

Applicant: Garfield A. Bruff
Owner: City of Newburgh
Location: 169 Johnston Street

Returning for determination to install new windows, install new front door, install new light fixtures, repair brick, repair and paint fascia, repair concrete band, install new front entrance stairs and handrail and paint using colors from the Sherwin Williams Historic color palette.

Michael Henderson and Garfield A. Bruff appeared before the Board.

Mr. Henderson addressed the details requested at the March 2022 meeting.

Mr. Young asked for clarification of the window style.

Mr. Kelly said he recommended 1/1 or 2/2 style at the March meeting.

Mr. Young asked what the stair tread material will be.

Mr. Henderson said pre-cast concrete.

Mr. Young asked if the applicant would consider bluestone.

Mr. Hanson added the bluestone will hold up better than pre-cast concrete.

Mr. Bruff agreed to the bluestone treads.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson held the public hearing open.

Chris Hanson moved to approve application as submitted, subject to the following conditions:

- Windows shall be 1/1 style
- Front entrance stair treads masonry to be made of bluestone.

The Chairperson seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2022-026

Applicant: Thien Nguyen
Owner: Thien Nguyen
Location: 411-413 Liberty Street

Returning for determination of removal of existing concrete steps and replacement of wood steps.

Thien Nguyen appeared before the Board and addressed the details requested at the March 2022 meeting.

The Chairperson asked for confirmation that the applicant removed the stairs and replaced them with wooden stairs.

Mr. Nguyen confirmed.

The Chairperson asked for confirmation that the temporary stairs will be replaced.

Mr. Nguyen confirmed.

The Chairperson asked if both 411 and 413 Liberty Street stairs will be replaced.

Mr. Nguyen confirmed adding he has not received a response from his neighbor to contract together on a replacement of the combined stoop at 411 and 413 Liberty Street.

Mr. Hanson said the drawings do not include measurements, spandrel dimensions or type, or hand rail and base rail details.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

The Chairperson said to approve the application, the requested details are required for submission to the Building Department to follow and approve for permit.

The Chairperson asked the applicant if he would like to table the application for further detail or take the application to a vote.

Mr. Nguyen requested a vote.

The Chairperson moved to approve the application.

Chris Hanson seconded the motion.

The motion was denied 0-5 via roll-call vote.

AR 2022-023

Applicant: Habitat for Humanity of Greater Newburgh
Owner: Habitat for Humanity of Greater Newburgh
Location: 64 Overlook Place

Returning for determination to rebuild the front porch.

Mike Brooks appeared before the Board and addressed the front porch details requested at the March 2022 meeting.

Mr. Young asked if the porch roof is three-sided with hip corners.

Mr. Brooks confirmed.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

The Chairperson moved to approve the balance of the application as submitted.

Chris Hanson seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2022-005

Applicant: Jonathan Powell
Owner: AHNA 52 Chambers LLC
Location: 52 Chambers Street

Returning for determination on front staircase (newel posts, balustrades and railings).

Jonathan Powell appeared before the Board and addressed the front staircase details requested at the January 2022 meeting

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

Chris Hanson moved to approve the balance of the application as submitted.
The Chairperson seconded the motion.
The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2022-011

Applicant: Rashidah Green-Sherman
Owner: Doti Ventures LLC
Location: 118 Dubois Street

Returning for determination of the 1st and 2nd floor rear porches, rear spiral staircase and 1st & 2nd floor rear porches portions of the application.

James Kelly recused himself from the vote.

Rashidah Green-Sherman and Dan Harris appeared before the Board.

Rashidah Green-Sherman addressed the details requested at the March 2022 meeting, and noted that the proposed color scheme has changed.

Ms. Green-Sherman presented a new, screened-in porch design for the rear.

Mr. Hanson asked for confirmation that there is no balustrade on the 1st floor rear porch.

Ms. Green-Sherman confirmed.

Mr. Hanson said Building Code might require a balustrade given the elevation of the 1st floor rear porch. In addition, aesthetically the 1st floor should match with the 2nd floor balustrade.

Mr. Young agreed. He also said the 2nd floor front porch does not seem historically appropriate.

Mr. Hanson said there is no door on the 2nd floor front porch to indicate that a 2nd floor porch was originally there.

The Chairperson asked if there is a door to get onto the 2nd floor front porch.

Ms. Green-Sherman said they will convert one of the windows into a door.

Mr. Hanson said that is an architectural change that is not representing on the drawings.

Ms. Flanagan said they would need to see the proposed door on the drawings to make a determination.

The Chairperson asked the applicant if a balustrade on the 1st floor rear porch could be considered.

Ms. Green-Sherman said yes.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson held the public hearing open.

Mr. Harris asked if a spindled rail behind the screen is acceptable, subject to final detail.

The Chairperson said as long as fits the architectural design of the building.

Mr. Hanson said he does not view the screen as a structural element of the porch.

Ms. Green-Sherman asked if the color change is acceptable.

The Chairperson said confirmed.

The Applicant requested tabling the application for opportunity to submit further detail.

AR 2022-024

Applicant: 3 Fratelli Inc. / Ben Papaleo
Owner: 3 Fratelli Inc.
Location: 242 Broadway

Returning for determination to install new windows, repair/replace sills, install new lintels, repair/replace and paint cornice and fascia, install new wood panels, trim and paint, install new fascia and trim, paint wood rake and trim, repair/repoint and remove paint on masonry, install new store front, panel, trim and paint and install new shingles. Paint using colors from the Sherwin Williams Historic color palette.

Ben Papaleo and Michael Papaleo appeared before the Board.

Ben Papaleo addressed the details requested at the March 2022 meeting

Mr. Hanson asked if the windows on the north elevation were removed and closed off with brick.

Mr. Michael Papaleo confirmed.

Mr. Ben Papaleo said an elevator shaft and staircase take up the whole side of the north elevation, which prevents from keeping the existing windows.

Mr. Hanson asked why the storefront continues to have a bricked edge at the Broadway/Carpenter Avenue corner.

Mr. Ben Papaleo said the bricked corner was approved by the Building Department.

The Assistant Corporation Counsel clarified that the Building Department approved a temporary shoring plan as a remediation measure for an immediate threat of collapse. The Building Department approval was not intended as a substitute for a final exterior design plan. He said the applicant will need to submit a separate plan for interior and exterior structural elements, and if there are certain

structural impediments that impact an exterior design, the applicant needs to present evidence to the Board about why certain exterior design elements are impractical or infeasible.

Mr. Kelly said the proposed treatment of the storefront is not historically accurate; the sign board is too large. He also said buildings from that period would have had a drip hood above the spandrel header.

Mr. Young said the storefront windows traditionally would reach the top of the ceiling line. The sign board is taking up much of that space making it appear disproportionate for a storefront of that period.

Mr. Young said the chimney should be raised higher for prominent appearance. He said the storefront could wrap around the full height, cast iron corner post with two steel high beams.

Mr. Kelly said the drawing does not depict the mansard polychrome slate pattern. He said a mansard roof of that period would have arched windows, not squared. He recommended blocking out and painting the existing windows on the north elevation to keep the original fenestration.

Mr. Hanson said the north elevation does not look appropriate without windows and recommended false windows. On the storefront, he recommended the glass reaching to the corner and minimizing the brick massing.

The Chairperson reiterated the Board's comments and recommendations:

- The storefront should be end-to-end along the Broadway side.
- The signboard size should be reduced to look more period-appropriate.
- There should be a drip hood above the spandrel header.
- The chimneys should be raised approximately two feet higher.
- The mansard roof dormer windows should be arched as original, with a corresponding arched eyebrow.
- The mansard roof should have a detail/pattern, with polychrome detail if possible.
- The north elevation should contain windows, with a faux window being acceptable.
- The proposed brick corner should be replaced and wrapped with glass detail.

The Assistant Corporation Counsel asked the applicants to call out these details on the plan to assist in the Board's review.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

Carson Carter said the four original cast iron columns are intact and are worth saving.

The Chairperson held the public hearing open.

The Applicant requested tabling the application for opportunity to submit further detail.

NEW BUSINESS

AR 2022-029

Applicant: Gerald Brauer / Go Permits
Owner: Betty J. Thornton
Location: 57 Henry Avenue

Application to install new windows.

Carlton Stone appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the proposed project, replacement of two basement hopper vinyl windows.

Mr. Kelly asked what the window materials are for the rest of the house.

Mr. Stone said vinyl.

The Chairperson asked if the applicant would consider a composite material.

Mr. Kelly requested photos of the existing basement windows.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

Carson Carter said the building is not abandoned and is not clear on what material the windows are currently.

The Chairperson held the public hearing open.

The Chairperson tabled the application at the request of the applicant and further submission of photos of the existing basement windows.

AR 2022-031

Applicant: Reggie Young
Owner: William Cappelletti
Location: 159 Broadway

Application to install new front entrance door, install new window and install new ADA-compliant ramp, landing and safety railing.

Reggie Young recused himself from vote.

Reggie Young appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the proposed project.

The Chairperson asked if there will be lighting above the sign board.

Mr. Young said no.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

James Kelly moved to accept the application as submitted.

The Chairperson seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2022-033

Applicant: Berg + Moss Architects / Chris Berg

Owner: Stephen & Adam Fanning

Location: 34 South Miller Street

Application to repair and replace cornice/molding, install new front door and surrounding molding, install new windows and paint using colors from the Benjamin Moore Historic color palette.

Chris Berg appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the proposed project.

The Chairperson asked if the rear elevation is visible from the street.

Mr. Berg said no.

Mr. Hanson said the railings do not look historically appropriate.

Ms. Flanagan said the lighting fixture does not seem to fit the architectural style of the house.

Mr. Kelly agreed with Mr. Hanson and Ms. Flanagan.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

The Chairperson moved to accept a portion of the application as submitted, tabling the portion of the application regarding front porch staircase railing and light fixture details.

Chris Hanson seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2022-034

Applicant: Berg + Moss Architects / Chris Berg

Owner: 40 South Miller LLC

Location: 40 South Miller Street

Application to repair and replace cornice/molding, install new front door and surrounding molding, install new windows and paint using colors from the Benjamin Moore Historic color palette.

Chris Berg appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the proposed project.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

Chris Hanson moved to accept the application as submitted.

James Kelly seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2022-035

Applicant: Berg + Moss Architects / Chris Berg
Owner: Randy McMurtrie and Stephanie Bloomer
Location: 35 South Lander Street

Application to install sidewalks.

Chris Berg and Randy McMurtrie appeared before the Board

Chris Berg gave an overview of the proposed project. He said they are proposing brushed concrete on South William Street and South Lander Street will maintain the stamped bluestone. He said they are proposing concrete curbing in lieu of granite curb.

The Assistant Corporation Counsel said before the ARC considers a variance for deviation from the City Sidewalk Standards, a comment letter from the Engineer Department is required. The comment letter was not available for presentation at this meeting.

Mr. Kelly said the property did not originally have granite curbs. He said this property has not replaced a 19th century building. For a long period it was a gas station.

The Chairperson asked why one side is stamped and the other is not stamped.

Mr. McMurtrie said he is mimicking what other properties did from Liberty Street. up to South William Street.

Mr. Berg said the applicant would prefer to use concrete and not simulate bluestone.

Mr. Young said that would look better.

The Chairperson and Mr. Hanson agreed.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

Carson Carter spoke in favor of granite curbing.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

The Chairperson tabled the application to await the Engineering Department's comment letter.

AR 2022-037

Applicant: Davide Blanc & Michele Basch
Owner: Davide Blanc & Michele Basch
Location: 103 Washington Street

Application to install five new windows and a new front door.

Michele Basch recused herself from vote.

Davide Blanc appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the proposed project.

He said the windows were replaced 20 years ago with vinyl sashes. He is looking at 2 possibilities for replacement: brick to brick double hung wood clad or completing a full restoration of the jambs and weights and find period sashes.

Mr. Young asked if the windows would be 2/2 style.

Mr. Blanc said he has not decided yet, the adjoining homes have 1/1 style.

Mr. Blanc said the proposed door is a 1910's, full wood, 6-panel with box lock and white porcelain knobs white door.

Mr. Kelly asked if the sidelights will remain.

Mr. Blanc said he will keep the original doorway, restoring the sidelights and transom.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

Chris Hanson moved to accept the application as submitted, with applicant having the option of replacing with clad wood windows or clad wood sashes to fit into the original window jambs. The applicant shall also have the option of installing 2/2, 4/4 or 6/6 window styles, provided that all windows are the same configuration.

James Kelly seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2022-038

Applicant: Gibbons Engineering
Owner: Sarah Mekhail
Location: 31 Lutheran Street

Application to install new windows, install new front door and paint using colors from the Benjamin Moore Historic color palette.

Alvin Moonesar appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the proposed project.

The Chairperson asked the applicant why the front entrance door selection is of vinyl material instead of a wooden door.

Mr. Moonesar said to match the materials on the bay windows.

Mr. Kelly said the paneled bay window and the 6/6 style is not historically accurate and the drawing lacks detail.

Mr. Hanson agreed with Mr. Kelly and recommended 1/1 or 2/2 style windows. He also said the front entrance door has to be wood material. The treatment of the bay windows with synthetic material is not historically accurate. Mr. Hanson requested a door cut sheet and new treatment for the cladding of the bay windows.

Mr. Young requested door details and measurements and additional details on how the bay windows are being handled.

The Chairperson agreed with the prior comments.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

The Applicant requested tabling the application for opportunity to submit further detail.

AR 2022-036

Applicant: Kurv Architects / Alexander Loyer Hughes, AIA
Owner: 245-249 Broadway Partners LLC
Location: 245-249 Broadway Partners LLC

Application to install security roll gates.

Eddie Shea appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the proposed project.

Ms. Flanagan asked about security concerns versus what the guidelines dictate.

The Assistant Corporation Counsel prior Board decisions seemed to interpret the guidelines as whether the gates would touch the façade storefronts, blocking storefront windows, or be set further back away from the storefront detail. Here, the building’s inset allows for the gate to not touch the façade.

Mr. Young asked if the mechanism is stored above the line of the building façade band, making it invisible.

Mr. Shea said the mechanism will not be visible.

The Chairperson agreed with the previous comments.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

The Chairperson moved to accept the application as submitted.

Chris Hanson seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

With no further business to discuss, the meeting adjourned at 11:00 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted:

Approved:

J.K. Gentile, Secretary

Michele Basch, Chairperson