

MINUTES
ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW COMMISSION
Meeting of April 11, 2023

The monthly meeting of the City of Newburgh Architectural Review Commission (“ARC”) was held on Tuesday, April 11, 2023 at 6:30 p.m. at the Activity Center, 401 Washington Street, Newburgh, New York 12550.

Members Present: Michele Basch, Chairperson
Carson Carter
Kate Flanagan
Chris Hanson
Gregory Nato

Absent: Michael Buonanno
James Kelly
Schnekwa McNeil

Also Present: Jeremy Kaufman, Assistant Corporation Counsel
J.K. Gentile, Secretary to the Land Use Boards

Meeting called to order at 6:33 p.m.

Minutes of the February 14, 2023 ARC meeting

Chris Hanson moved to accept the minutes from the February 2023 ARC meeting.
Carson Carter seconded the motion.
The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

Minutes of the March 14, 2023 ARC meeting

Minutes not available for review. Tabled for next month.

CONSENT AGENDA

AR 2023-036

Applicant: Eli Vaknin
Owner: 234 Broadway Associates LLC
Location: 232 Broadway

Application to paint using colors from the Benjamin Moore Historic Color palette.

AR 2023-042

Applicant: Dean Koman
Owner: IRTE, LLC
Location: 192 Lander Street

Application to paint using colors from the Benjamin Moore Historic Color palette.

AR 2023-043

Applicant: Myriam Murphy
Owner: KHM Grand Inc.
Location: 152 Grand Street

Application to paint using colors from the Benjamin Moore Historic Color palette.

AR 2023-024

Applicant: Berg + Moss Architects / Jonathan Moss
Owner: Newburgh SHG 98 LLC
Location: 94 Overlook Place

Application to paint using colors from the Benjamin Moore Historic Color palette.

AR 2023-025

Applicant: Berg + Moss Architects / Jonathan Moss
Owner: Newburgh SHG 99 LLC
Location: 96 Overlook Place

Application to paint using colors from the Benjamin Moore Historic Color palette.

AR 2023-035

Applicant: Hector Gualpa
Owner: Hector Gualpa
Location: 167 Chambers Street

Application to paint using colors from the Benjamin Moore Historic Color palette.

AR 2023-027

Applicant: Newburgh SHG 97 LLC
Owner: Newburgh SHG 97 LLC
Location: 90 Overlook Place

Application to paint using colors from the Benjamin Moore Historic Color palette.

AR 2023-028

Applicant: Newburgh SHG 100 LLC
Owner: Newburgh SHG 100 LLC
Location: 97 Overlook Place

Application to paint using colors from the Benjamin Moore Historic Color palette.

AR 2023-029

Applicant: Newburgh SHG 101 LLC
Owner: Newburgh SHG 101 LLC
Location: 98 Overlook Place

Application to paint using colors from the Benjamin Moore Historic Color palette.

AR 2023-030

Applicant: Newburgh SHG 102 LLC
Owner: Newburgh SHG 102 LLC
Location: 100 Overlook Place

Application to paint using colors from the Benjamin Moore Historic Color palette.

AR 2023-031

Applicant: Newburgh SHG 58 LLC
Owner: Newburgh SHG 58 LLC
Location: 101 Overlook Place

Application to paint using colors from the Benjamin Moore Historic Color palette.

AR 2023-032

Applicant: Newburgh SHG 103 LLC
Owner: Newburgh SHG 103 LLC
Location: 84 Overlook Place

Application to paint using colors from the Benjamin Moore Historic Color palette.

AR 2023-033

Applicant: Newburgh SHG 37 LLC
Owner: Newburgh SHG 37 LLC
Location: 99 Overlook Place

The Chairperson moved to approve the Consent Agenda as submitted.
Chris Hanson seconded the motion.
The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

OLD BUSINESS

AR 2022-001

Applicant: Washberth McKnight
Owner: Washberth McKnight
Location: 178 Broadway

Returning for determination on a request for ratification of an installed sign.

Washberth McKnight appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the project.

The Chairperson moved to approve the application as submitted.
Kate Flanagan seconded the motion.
The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2021-023

Applicant: Mike Brooks
Owner: Habitat for Humanity of Greater Newburgh
Location: 157 North Miller Street

Amendment to 4/13/21 approved application.
Substituting approved porch columns to porch support bracket.

Mike Brooks appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the proposed project.

Chris Hanson moved to approve the application as submitted.
Carson Carter seconded the motion.
The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2023-021

Applicant: Pastor Robert McLymore
Owner: Life Restoration Church, LLC
Location: 136 First Street

Hardship application to ratify work performed: installation of new windows.

Pastor Robert McLymore and Mary McLymore appeared before the Board.

Pastor McLymore gave an overview of submitted material supporting his hardship application.

Assistant Corporation Counsel reviewed City Code §300-41(C) regarding economic hardship criteria.

Mr. Carter asked about the plans to replace the remaining windows.

Pastor McLymore said there are no plans for additional projects as the Church does not have the budget.

Ms. Flanagan recommended researching Sacred Spaces funding for future modifications.

Mr. Hanson said he considers the remaining original factory windows, the windows that have already been replaced and the windows replaced with ARC approval years ago. He recommended pursuing grant funding to allow appropriate replacement of the remaining windows.

Mr. Carter said the window replacement on this notable, corner building impacts the character of the neighborhood. He said not obtaining a building permit to perform the work is a self-created hardship.

The Chairperson agreed and added that if the process did start with a building permit denial initiating an ARC application, she believes it would have led the situation down the same path of not being able to afford new windows and the windows would have remained boarded up. She said allowing the hardship will allow un-boarded up windows. She said moving forward and knowing the appropriate process to renovate within the East End Historic District, she recommended pursuing financial opportunities (grant funding) to assist with the cost.

Mr. Nato agreed and said the applicant is aware of the appropriate process for restoration within the East End Historic District.

Gregory Nato moved to approve the economic hardship application as submitted.

The Chairperson seconded the motion.

The motion was approved 4-1 via roll-call vote.

AR 2022-137

Applicant: Rene Gonzalez Orta
Owner: 129 3rd Street of Newburgh LLC
Location: 66 Campbell Street

Returning for determination to install new windows, new front door, new side door, new fascia, new balusters, new siding, new gutters, new floor tiles and concrete ramp on front entry porch and repair/repoint brick.

James Gibbons and Rene Gonzalez Orta appeared before the Board.

James Gibbons gave an overview of the requested revisions and details from the March meeting.

Mr. Hanson asked if the Hardie Board would be 8” width.

Mr. Gibbons said no, the Hardie Board would be 6” width.

Mr. Carter said the wood grain finish is not historically appropriate.

Mr. Hanson said he prefers 8” width as it is in keeping with what is on the house currently.

Mr. Gibbons said the owner is willing to change the size of the siding to 8”.

Mr. Gonzalez said he would use smooth wood siding instead of Hardie Board.

Mr. Carter said the front door height should match the height of the first-floor windows and said currently there is false framing.

Mr. Gibbons said they opened the framing in the back and there is no evidence of side lights from the framing.

Mr. Carter said the west wall is a large, empty wall, no windows.

Mr. Gibbons said they chose not to install windows for any potential future building on the adjacent lot.

Carson Carter moved to approve the application as submitted, subject to the following conditions:

- The siding will be a smooth wood finish siding in 8” width.
- The front door lintel height will be adjusted to match the height of the ground first floor windows.

Chris Hanson seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2023-006

Applicant: Berg + Moss Architects / Jonathan Moss
Owner: Newburgh SHG 8 LLC
Newburgh SHG 9 LLC
Newburgh SHG 10 LLC
Location: 150-156 Broadway

Returning for determination to construct a new 5-story infill mixed-use building in an existing vacant lot.

Jonathan Moss appeared before the Board, gave an overview of the revisions, and brought the material samples requested by the Board at the March 2023 meeting. He said there were minor changes made to the storefront; it will be all glass. He said there is an added roof bulkhead amenity that is barely visible.

Mr. Hanson asked about the lighting plan.

Mr. Moss said there will be a “wall wash” to illuminate the face of the building and downlights at the two entrances, the signage lighting and the cornice lighting at the top.

Mr. Carter asked for additional details on the bulkhead.

Mr. Moss, using the rendering, explained the details.

Gregory Nato moved to approve the application as submitted.
The Chairperson seconded the motion.
The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2022-125

Applicant: Berg + Moss Architects / Chris Berg
Owner: Guy R. Larocca
Location: 211 Broadway

Returning for determination on demolition of an existing 3-bay garage and 1 story office.

At the Board’s request the Assistant Corporation Counsel called into record AR2023-012 to be discussed in tandem with the demolition portion of this application.

AR 2023-012

Applicant: Berg + Moss Architects / Chris Berg
Owner: Guy R. Larocca
Location: 211 Broadway

Application to construct a new, mixed-use building.

Chris Berg appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the concerns addressed by the Board at the March 2023 meeting.

Mr. Hanson said there are substantial improvements made to the Ann Street side but is still missing the additions to generate more foot traffic.

Mr. Flanagan said the proposal still does not meet the standards for demolition of the existing structures on the property in her opinion. She said the proposed building varies too significantly from the architectural context of the surrounding buildings including the massing and the height.

Mr. Carter asked what the plans for the adjacent lots are.

Mr. Berg said the east and west lots are currently vacant.

Mr. Nato said he is satisfied with the improvements made.

The Chairperson said she is satisfied with the revisions. She said she likes the harmony and movement the design change made to the building.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

The Chairperson moved to approve the application, AR2022-125, as submitted.

Chris Hanson seconded the motion.

The motion passed 4-1 via roll-call vote.

The Chairperson moved to approve the application, AR2023-012, as submitted.

Chris Hanson seconded the motion.

The motion passed 4-1 via roll-call vote.

NEW BUSINESS

AR 2023-020

Applicant: Eli Vaknin
Owner: Doris Kason and Michael Kason
Location: 165 Liberty Street

Application to install new windows.

Eli Vaknin appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the proposed project.

Mr. Carter asked to confirm the windows will be single pane, 1/1 style windows.

Mr. Vaknin confirmed.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

Carson Carter moved to approve the application as submitted.

Chris Hanson seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2023-037

Applicant: Karl Burrell/Burrell Management & Maintenance LLC
Owner: Simangaye Xaba
Location: 8 Liberty Street WH

Application to repoint the brick and restore the front porch steps.

Karl Burrell and Simangaye Xaba appeared before the Board.

Mr. Burrell gave an overview of the proposed project.

The Chairperson asked if the steps will be painted.

Mr. Burrell said yes in Benjamin Moore Ethel White Ivory.

Mr. Hanson said the porch balustrades, handrails, spindles, and bottom rail are not historically accurate. He said this is a Victorian-era house. He recommended taking cues from the neighboring porches.

Mr. Carter recommended confirming that the stairs meet the City Code height requirement.

Mr. Nato agreed with Mr. Hanson.

Mr. Hanson requested drawings with side views, height and the type of spindle.

Mr. Carter recommended using Type M lime-based mortar for the old, soft brick.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

The applicant requested a table of its application to submit additional details regarding the porch and brick mortar.

AR 2023-038

Applicant: Erik Cooney
Owner: 96 Carson, LLC
Location: 98 Carson Avenue

Application to install new windows.

Erik Cooney appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the proposed project.

Ms. Flanagan asked what is currently there.

Mr. Cooney said the original windows. He said the windows are in poor condition.

Mr. Nato asked if the dimensions of the trim are going to change.

Mr. Cooney said no. He said the plan is to keep it as is and match what is next door.

Ms. Flanagan asked if it is possible to repair rather than replace.

Mr. Cooney said it was possible.

The Board recommended attempting repair in kind.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

The applicant requested a table of the application to review repair versus replace options.

AR 2023-039

Applicant: Berg + Moss Architects / Jonathan Moss
Owner: Friendly Management Services LLC
Location: 172 Broadway

Application to install a new storefront, install new doors, install new windows, install new lighting, install new signage band, remove satellite dishes, and roll down gates, repoint brick and paint using colors from the Benjamin Moore Historic Color palette.

Jonathan Moss appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the proposed project.

Mr. Carter asked if there are cast iron posts behind what is currently there.

Mr. Moss said yes and that the cast iron posts will be exposed within the storefront design.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

Kate Flanagan moved to approve the application as submitted.

The Chairperson seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2023-040

Applicant: Berg + Moss Architects / Jonathan Moss
Owner: Mydico, LLC
Location: 129 Johnston Street

Application to install new front entrance door, install new lighting, construct new front porch, install new gutters, install new cornice, repoint brick and paint using colors from the Benjamin Moore Historic Color palette.

Jonathan Moss appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the proposed project.

Mr. Carter asked if SHPO is involved.

Mr. Moss said no.

Mr. Moss said the porch that is currently there is not historically accurate. He said the Google Earth photo from 2019 is the closest reference to what might have been the original porch and that the proposed plan is to restore it as close as possible to that image.

The Chairperson asked if they are keeping the door presented in the current conditions photo.

Mr. Moss said the salvaged door in the current photo is falling apart and they propose replacing the front entrance door.

The Chairperson asked if the porch roof is flat.

Mr. Moss said it is mildly pitched.

Mr. Hanson asked if the front cornice is brick.

Mr. Moss said the front cornice was wood and was ripped off.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

Gregory Nato moved to approve the application as submitted.

Carson Carter seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2023-041

Applicant: Berg + Moss Architects / Jonathan Moss
Owner: ESTRABANY LLC
Location: 162 Dubois Street

Application to install new front entrance door, install new windows, install new siding, restore front porch and paint using colors from the Benjamin Moore Historic Color palette.

Jon Moss appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the proposed project.

Mr. Nato asked about the porch dentil that is not shown in the rendering.

Mr. Moss said the porch dentil will be restored. He said the porch will not be removed; it will be restored.

Mr. Hanson asked what the reveal of the siding is.

Mr. Moss said 4" width.

Mr. Carter asked if they would consider 6” width siding.

Ms. Flanagan asked if the new windows are a different size than what is currently there.

Mr. Moss said there is existing vertical casing that will be replaced with white Hardie Plank siding.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

Gregory Nato moved to approve the application as submitted subject to the following conditions:

- The Hardiplank lap siding will be in 6” width (instead of 4”).
- The front railing must be repaired or replaced in-kind and be accompanied by an elevation drawing to reflect the same.

The Chairperson seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

With no further business to discuss, the meeting adjourned at 8:27 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted:

Approved:

J.K. Gentile, Secretary

Michele Basch, Chairperson