

**CITY OF NEWBURGH
ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW COMMISSION**

Brigidanne Flynn, Acting Chairperson

123 Grand Street, Newburgh, N.Y. 12550

Phone: (845) 569-7400

Fax: (845) 569-0096

**MINUTES
ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW COMMISSION
Meeting of
September 8, 2015**

The regular meeting of the City of Newburgh Architectural Review Commission was held on Tuesday, September 8, 2015 at 7:30 p.m. in City Hall Council Chambers, 83 Broadway

Members Present: Brigidanne Flynn, Acting Chairperson
Paula Stevens
Rich Rosencrans
Isaac Diggs
Michelle Basch
Christopher Hanson

Also Present: Timothy Kramer, Assistant Corporation Counsel
Eliana Diaz, Land Use Board Secretary

The meeting was called to order at 7:30 p.m. after a quorum was confirmed.

OLD BUSINESS

AR 2015-15

216 Montgomery Street

To remove one dormer on the east elevation and add four new dormers on the north, south and east elevation to match the existing dormer in size and architectural style, to install windows of similar double hung style as currently exists, six over six configuration, white vinyl clad exterior with wood interior.

Applicant/Owner: Piotr Jagninski

DISCUSSION

Christopher Hanson recused himself from this application.

Jason Lichwick of Minuta Architecture and Anja Beutler, co-owner of the property, appeared. This application was presented at the June ARC meeting and was tabled for the applicant to explore further options regarding the dormers. Mr. Lichwick stated that

he spoke to the Office of Parks, Recreation and Historic Preservation, who approved the project, and presented their letter stating that the work proposed is acceptable. The letter further states that the new dormers are not an eligible expense. Mr. Lichwick stated that the top floor, where the dormer work is proposed, is currently occupied. No drawings of the west elevation were submitted. Paula Stevens stated that she would have liked to see how the dormers would look straight on. She stated that the building is historically significant and that it was designed by a renowned architect. She feels that removing the architectural feature is against the commissions' task. Mr. Lichwick presented photographs of the building, including the west elevation, as well as photographs of other buildings in the area designed by the same architect.

Ms. Beutler submitted a letter to the commission stating the reasons why the application requested dormers rather than skylights. She also stated that she would like to have more light on the top floor as well as views of the river. A discussion was held regarding the history of the building, including that when the house was built, there was no intention of people living on the top floor. Michelle Basch stated that buildings must change with time, and with more living space, more light is required. Isaac Diggs stated that he has no problem with the addition of dormers on the north and south elevations, but does not like the removal of architectural details. Brigidanne Flynn stated that the applicant is trying to make the most of what is there, that it is an adaptive re-use. The applicant is changing the roof because the use is changing. Rich Rosencrans stated the original intent in the design has changed, because there is now a living space. If the original intent was a living space, it would have included more dormers.

The ARC issued a negative declaration and closed the public hearing at the June meeting.

A motion to approve the application to add a dormer to the north elevation and a dormer to the south elevation, as submitted, and to table the portion of the motion regarding the east elevation was made by Rich Rosencrans and seconded by Isaac Diggs.

The motion was approved 4-1. Paula Stevens voted against the motion.

A motion regarding the tabled portion of the motion on the east elevation to add flat plane skylights to the left and right of the existing dormer was made by Michelle Basch and seconded by Paula Stevens.

The motion was approved 4-1. Brigidanne Flynn voted against the motion.

PUBLIC HEARINGS

Discussion and public hearing, at the request of the City of Newburgh, on remedies, including potential demolition, for severely distressed properties at the following locations:

**169 JOHNSTON STREET
191 SOUTH STREET
68 CAMPBELL STREET
115 JOHNSTON STREET
2 LIBERTY STREET
161 LANDER STREET
139 JOHNSTON STREET
109 CHAMBERS STREET
132 THIRD STREET
140 THIRD STREET
251 THIRD STREET
76 LANDER STREET
28 COURTNEY AVE
254 LIBERTY STREET**

DISCUSSION

Deirdre Glenn, City of Newburgh Director of Planning and Development, and Assistant City Engineer, Chad Wade, appeared. Ms. Glenn stated that a number of City properties have been identified as being in very poor shape. The City has obtained federal money which may be used on these buildings. There are federal regulations with which the City must comply in order to use the federal money, which includes a public hearing. Ms. Glenn stated that not all buildings are being proposed for demolition, but wanted to include them in the public hearing in the event that, after investigation, it is determined demolition is the best remedy.

Mr. Wade presented a slide show of each of the buildings using google street images, which are from 2012. He went through portions of the report of the Chazen Companies, which performed the structural engineering analysis and provided recommendations. City Planner, Alexandra Church, previously provided the ARC with copies of the report. Mr. Wade presented properties that were not on the Chazen list but which are in poor condition. These properties are properties which the City now owns after taking title in tax foreclosure. Mr. Wade went to each of those properties with Central Hudson. He states that all of those properties are in the same or similar condition as the properties in the Chazen report.

A discussion was held regarding what will be empty lots after demolition is complete. Christopher Hanson spoke about 28 Courtney Avenue, stating that this building is more integrated into the neighbor's house as there is no separation in the brick façade. He asked if it is possible to reach out to somebody who can save the building, because there are people looking to buy buildings in this condition who perform rehabilitation if the building is not too far gone. Ms. Glenn stated that this is an option, and she would look into this.

Isaac Diggs asked if it is possible to offer the vacant lot to the neighbor. Ms. Glenn stated that it is the City policy to offer the lots to the neighbors for a small sum of money.

The acting chairperson opened the public hearing.

Paula Dowd, a City of Newburgh resident, stated that she made an offer on 28 Courtney Avenue; however, after talking with contractors, it would be cost prohibitive to rehabilitate the building.

The public hearing remains open.

AR 2015-42

22 South Miller

To perform a gut rehabilitation with restoration to include new windows, doors, porch and roof with the installation of a wood gate between 22 and 24 South Miller Street.

Applicant: Habitat for Humanity of Greater Newburgh

Owner: Newburgh Community Land Bank

DISCUSSION

Nate Litwin, Construction Manager for Habitat for Humanity, presented the applications for 2015-42, 2015-36 and 2015-37. He stated that Habitat for Humanity is hoping to start with these three buildings on South Miller Street, and possibly add another building. A gut rehabilitation will be performed on each of the buildings with restoration to include new windows, doors, porches and roofs. Wood gates will be installed between 22 and 24 South Miller Street, and 24 and 26 South Miller Street. Mr. Litwin stated that he would like to restore the front doors where possible, but where it is not possible, to install Therma-Tru doors which have been approved by the ARC on other projects in the past. He stated that the vestibule at 24 South Miller will be preserved. The front porch on 24 South Miller will be the same size as 22 South Miller. Mr. Litwin is hoping to restore most of the porch on 26 South Miller, and will demo and build new porches on the other two buildings. A discussion was held regarding the cornices. Mr. Litwin stated that the standard practice is, depending on the condition, to take the cornice down, bring to the shop, and create the same as near as possible. He further stated that chimneys are usually removed because they are an ongoing maintenance expense for the low income property owners. He further stated that if the porch on 22 South Miller is blue, the door will be green. He will use 2/2 windows as depicted in the rendering submitted with the application rather than 2/1 as specified on the materials sheet submitted with the application.

The acting chairperson opened the public hearing. There was no one present to speak for or against any of these applications. The public hearings were closed.

Michelle Basch moved and Paula Stevens seconded the motion to assume SEQRA lead agency. The motion was carried unanimously.

Rich Rosencrans moved and Michelle Basch seconded the motion for a negative declaration. The motion was carried unanimously.

A motion to approve the application as submitted using the materials on the materials sheet submitted with the application, with the exception that the windows will be 2/2

rather than 2/1, the missing or deteriorated elements of the cornice will be repaired and fabricated using custom wood, and to demolish the porch and rebuild using the materials set forth in the application was made by Paula Stevens and seconded by Isaac Diggs.

The motion was approved 6-0.

AR 2015-36

24 South Miller

To perform a gut rehabilitation with restoration to include new windows, doors, porch and roof with the installation of a wood gate between 22 and 24 South Miller Street.

Applicant: Habitat for Humanity of Greater Newburgh

Owner: Newburgh Community Land Bank

Rich Rosencrans moved and Isaac Diggs seconded the motion to assume SEQRA lead agency. The motion was carried unanimously.

Rich Rosencrans moved and Isaac Diggs seconded the motion for a negative declaration. The motion was carried unanimously.

A motion to approve the application as submitted using the materials on the materials sheet submitted with the application, with the exception that the windows will be 2/2 rather than 2/1, the cornice will be repaired to match the existing cornice, and to demolish the porch and rebuild using the materials set forth in the application was made by Paula Stevens and seconded by Michelle Basch.

The motion was approved 6-0.

AR 2015-37

26 South Miller

To perform a gut rehabilitation with restoration to include new windows, doors, porch and roof with the installation of a wood gate between 24 and 26 South Miller Street.

Applicant: Habitat for Humanity of Greater Newburgh

Owner: Newburgh Community Land Bank

Rich Rosencrans moved and Chris Hanson seconded the motion to assume SEQRA lead agency. The motion was carried unanimously.

Rich Rosencrans moved and Chris Hanson seconded the motion for a negative declaration. The motion was carried unanimously.

A motion to approve the application as submitted using the materials on the materials sheet submitted with the application, with the exception that the windows will be 2/2 rather than 2/1, the cornice will be repaired as needed, and to repair the porch using the materials set forth in the application was made by Isaac Diggs and seconded by Paula Stevens.

The motion was approved 6-0.

AR 2015-38

243 Grand Street

To restore the windows, foundation, clapboards, front door and roof; paint clapboard and trim in white, shutters and door in gray; add a dormer on rear of building; and re-model rear enclosed porch.

Applicant: Eric Young and Reggie Young

Owner: Eric Young

DISCUSSION

Eric Young, applicant/owner of the property, appeared. He is proposing to restore the building as set forth in the application. The cellar windows will be three pane windows with single sash. The 6/6 upper windows are based on a photograph of the building from an unknown year found by his realtor. Brigidanne Flynn asked about the choice for a standing seam roof rather than remaining an asphalt roof. The applicant stated he felt it would be more historic. Christopher Hanson stated that the roof likely would have been cedar, although standing seam was used in the period in which the house was built.

The applicant is requesting the addition of a dormer and to change the enclosed rear porch. The dormer would be on the third floor. Christopher Hanson noted that it is facing away from the street such that the impact is minimal. Paula Stevens agreed and stated that the historical significance of this building is not as great as 216 Montgomery Street which was discussed earlier in the meeting, it is a different type of dormer, and the dormer is not completely visible from the street.

A discussion was held regarding the rear porch. The applicant stated that he would like the rear porch to be differentiated from the house, so he did not want to use the same clapboard. It was pointed out that the porch is already differentiated from the house because it is a different size clapboard. The applicant decided to keep the material as is.

The acting chairperson opened the public hearing. Paula Dowd, a resident of the City of Newburgh, stated that she thinks the application sounds great. There was no other person present to speak for or against the application. The public hearing was closed.

Rich Rosencrans moved and Michelle Basch seconded the motion to assume SEQRA lead agency. The motion was carried unanimously.

Rich Rosencrans moved and Michelle Basch seconded the motion for a negative declaration. The motion was carried unanimously.

A motion to approve the application as submitted with the exception of the standing seam roof, to retain the clapboard siding on the rear enclosed porch, and to replicate the clapboard of the rear porch on the dormer, and to table that portion of the application for a standing seam roof for the applicant to decide a color, was made by Christopher Hanson and seconded by Paula Stevens.

The motion was approved 6-0.

AR 2015-39

109 First Street

To remove asbestos siding and repair or replace shingles with clapboard siding in historic yellow, and to replace all windows with wood 2/2 black sashes.

Applicant/Owner: Julie Lindel and Paula Dowd

DISCUSSION

Paula Dowd and Julie Lindel, applicants/owners of the property, appeared. They would like to restore the house as close to the original as possible. The applicants are proposing to replace the faded grey asphalt shingles with black asphalt. They would like to remove the existing clapboards and replace with HardiePlank siding. The applicants originally requested historic yellow as a color in the application, but after further thought, they would like to use green or red instead of the yellow. They are further proposing to replace all of the windows with 2/2 true divided light windows. The proposed façade submitted with the application was discussed.

The acting chairperson opened the public hearing. There was no one present to speak for or against this application. The public hearing was closed.

Michelle Basch moved and Paula Stevens seconded the motion to assume SEQRA lead agency. The motion was carried unanimously.

Paula Stevens moved and Michelle Basch seconded the motion for a negative declaration. The motion was carried unanimously.

A motion to approve the application to replace the asphalt shingles with black asphalt shingles; to remove the asbestos and clapboard siding and replace with HardiePlank siding; to replace all windows with 2/2 true divided light, wood or aluminum clad windows; to paint the house using Benjamin Moore Historic Colors Georgian Green for the body, Bone White for the Trim and Black for the window sashes; and to approve the remainder of the application as submitted was made by Paula Stevens and seconded by Michelle Basch.

The motion was approved 6-0.

AR 2015-40

101 Liberty Street

To paint a sign on the window of the barbershop.

Applicant: Sergio Gonzalez

Owner: Galina Dementev

DISCUSSION

The applicant failed to appear. No action taken.

AR 2015-41

74 Carson Avenue

To replace windows with vinyl replacement windows.

Applicant/Owner: Daniel Green

DISCUSSION

Daniel Green, applicant/owner, appeared. He submitted photographs of the building. He would like to replace 11 front windows, 9 rear windows, 12 windows on the east side, and 2 windows on the west side, with 1/1 vinyl replacement windows. The applicant stated that the windows have all either rotted into the seam, are hanging crooked, or are missing.

Brigidanne Flynn stated that the ARC traditionally does not approve all vinyl windows. Christopher Hanson stated that the vinyl windows do not last very long, so although money can be saved up front, they will have to be replaced again. He further stated that the windows the applicant is proposing are not proportionate. The applicant stated that he cannot afford to replace with all wood windows. A discussion was held wherein the commission advised that windows can often be repaired/restored at a cheaper cost than new windows. The applicant stated that he will look into this.

The acting chairperson opened the public hearing. There was no one present to speak for or against this application. The public hearing was closed.

Paula Stevens moved and Michelle Basch seconded the motion to assume SEQRA lead agency. The motion was carried unanimously.

Paula Stevens moved and Michelle Basch seconded the motion for a negative declaration. The motion was carried unanimously.

A motion to table the application pending further information from the applicant was made by Paula Stevens and seconded by Christopher Hanson.

The motion was approved 6-0.

MISCELLANEOUS

The commission discussed a draft consent agenda policy and procedure. Paula Stevens moved and Christopher Hanson seconded the motion to approve the consent agenda policy and procedure.

The motion was carried 6-0.

Minutes of the August 11, 2015 Meeting

A motion to approve the minutes of the August 11, 2015 meeting was made by Paula Stevens and seconded by Isaac Diggs.

The motion was carried 5-0.

The meeting was adjourned at 11:10 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Timothy W. Kramer
Acting Secretary
Architectural Review Commission