

**CITY OF NEWBURGH**

**ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW COMMISSION**

**Mary Crabb, Chairperson**

**Nancy Evans, Secretary**

**123 Grand Street, Newburgh, N.Y. 12550**

**(845) 569-7400 Fax 569-0096**

ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW COMMISSION meeting of **January 8, 2008**.

The regular meeting of the City of Newburgh **Architectural Review Commission** was held on **Tuesday, January 8, 2008** at 7:30 p.m. in the Activity Center at 401 Washington Street, Newburgh, New York.

**Members Present:** Mary Crabb, Chair  
Peter King  
Brigidanne Flynn  
Michelle Basch  
Paula Stevens

**Members Absent:** Charles Passarotti

**Also present:** Michelle Kelson, Assistant Corporation Counsel

The meeting was called to order at 7:30 p.m. after a quorum was confirmed.

**OLD BUSINESS**

**AR 2007-111**

**68 Carson Avenue**

To replace fence with a wooden picket fence four feet tall in the middle and graduating up to 6 feet tall on the ends; replace roof on front porch with Sovereign Series GAF shingles in Charcoal color.

**Applicant: Manuel Balbuena**

Manuel Balbuena appeared before the board.

Mr. Balbuena explained the project to the board. They appeared before the board last month and were asked to come back with more information as to the materials they would be using, the height of the fence and photographs of the building both current and before the renovations were done. He provided photographs for the board. The fence is currently 4 feet 7 inches high. It is chain link now, they would like it to be wood.

Mr. Balbuena explained to Ms. Basch and Ms. Basch explained to the board members that there was a porch roof that was falling down and he took it down because it was dangerous for his son. He has supplied pictures of the materials that he wants to use. He also wants to fix the

deterioration of the stairs.

Mr. Balbuena – Provided pictures of the spindles he wants to use – a scalloped wood picket fence with graduated height. He would like to put an awning over the entrance to the basement – made of plastic – removable – white. Color – Soft Gloss – 096 BM.

Ms. Flynn – If there was a roof on that porch originally there is no way it would have been attached to the house. It must have been a free standing roof.

Ms. Flynn – Should we say that the fence would go to 4 feet 7 inches at its highest point?

Ms. Kelson – He will take down the chain link and be putting up a picket fence and he is proposing that at the highest corners it would be 6 feet high graduating to the center where it would only be 4 feet high. The current chain link fence is 4 feet 7 inches high.

The public hearing was closed at the December meeting.

A motion to approve the application was made by Mr. King to install a wood picket fence with a curve from four feet in the center to five feet 6 inches on the side. And replacement of the roof on the front porch with materials shown and the GAF shingles in the Charcoal color Sovereign Series. Fence will be white. I did not include the awning in my motion because it was not part of the application. The motion was seconded by Ms. Stevens.

The motion was denied with a vote of 2-3.

A motion to approve the awning in white – and it needs to be made of a vinyl material, not plastic – was made by Ms. Basch and seconded by Mr. King.

The motion was denied with a vote of 1-4.

**AR 2007-112**

**160 Fullerton Avenue**

To replace an exterior door with a four panel wood door in Chocolate Mahogany style and a new Andersen storm door from the 3000 Series.

**Applicant: Ian MacDougall**

The Chairman of the Board then opened the Public Hearing by reading the text of the notice.

Ian MacDougall appeared before the board.

Mr. MacDougall explained his project to the board. Provided a copy of his survey and an aerial photo. Vegetation surrounds the property, photos of current doors. This house is in Colonial Terrace and he consulted the guidelines. New Anderson storm from 3000 Series. Submitted a four panel door with application but discovered it was too expensive and he changed it to a six panel wood door CCM60 3' x 6'8".

Ms. Flynn – You are talking about a much larger door than standard size. Has had to have her door custom made because it is three feet wide.

There was no one present to speak for this application.

When the Chairperson asked if there was anyone present that would like to speak against this application the following individual spoke:

Brian Flannery, 5 Norton Street, Newburgh, New York

- Presented photos.
- Single French door.
- Ian has original French doors.
- All exterior doors in Colonial Terrace – half or full windows for more light.
- Avoided stained wood surfaces – out of character with district.

The public hearing was completed on January 8, 2008.

Mr. King – What is the framework in this photograph surrounding the waste cans?

Mr. MacDougall – A screened in porch.

Mr. King – What is visibility? We are looking at a door that has become an interior door.

Mr. MacDougall – The aerial photo shows that my property has 20 Norway maples on it to provide shade. Door does not face the street it faces south.

A motion to approve the application was made by Mr. King and seconded by Ms. Stevens.

The motion was approved with a vote of 4-1.

## **PUBLIC HEARINGS**

### **AR 2008-01**

#### **245 and 245A Grand Street**

To replace 10 windows with Regency Series vinyl replacement double hung windows and to replace the front door with a door to match the adjacent door. Both doors will be painted Cranberry to match the original color of the door being replaced.

**Applicant: David and Robin Darwin**

David Darwin appeared before the board.

Mr. Darwin explained his project to the board. They are two identical buildings attached to each other with one façade. Propose to replace 10 of the rectangular windows not the curved ones in the front. 7 of those windows were already replace with vinyl. The other 3 are wood – double hung in poor condition. Heating bills out of sight. Windows were not properly installed. Also want to replace the entrance door on the right with a door just like the left door

and paint them the same color. They prefer the cranberry color but will accept whatever color is best.

Ms. Flynn – do you have a quote or anything for repairing that existing door that you want to replace or to finding some sort of like replacement of that same style?

Mr. Darwin - \$1,200 – Does not have the quote with him.

Ms. Flynn – Also we recommend the vinyl clad wood replacement windows. Not the all-vinyl. We are only talking about 10 windows.

Mr. Darwin respectfully requests to be allowed to use the vinyl.

Ms. Kelson – Are there already vinyl replacements in the building?

Mr. Darwin – Yes. 3 are wood windows. Not touching windows that are round.

Mr. King – Concerned with door replacement.

Ms. Flynn – There was possibly an outer door and this was an interior foyer door.

Mr. King – With a pre-hung door you cannot maintain trim around door. You need to repair the frame and replace the door in kind. The other door is not acceptable. If it came before us I don't think it would be accepted.

Mr. Darwin would like to have both doors match.

Mr. King – The door on the right is more than likely the original.

Ms. Flynn – We have some good woodworking shops in the City.

There was no one present to speak for or against this application.

The public hearing was completed on January 8, 2008.

A motion to approve the application in regards to the replacing of the windows was made by Ms. Flynn and seconded by Ms. Stevens.

The motion was approved with a vote of 5-0.

A motion to approve the application to replace the front door was made by Ms. Flynn and seconded by Ms. Stevens.

The motion was denied with a vote of 0-5.

**AR 2008-02**

**72 Bay View Terrace**

To rebuild a demolished portion on the first floor into an office and to reconfigure the window placement from the original plans.

**Applicant: Presentation Educational Foundation, Sister Yliana Hernandez**

The Chairman of the Board then opened the Public Hearing by reading the text of the notice.

Sister Yliana Hernandez, Sister Sharon and Deirdre Glenn appeared before the board.

Sister Sharon explained the project to the board. We received prior approval. The design that was approved was for three windows in the front, five on the side and three in the back. The addition was not part of the original building. Structurally unsound. Would like to redesign windows so they are more in keeping and inline with the original structure.

Mr. King – It may be best to leave building as it is without putting the addition back on. It should have come to us first and now it has been destroyed.

Ms. Kelson – The original application proposed raising the whole building up. They moved forward with that approved plan and in the construction phase of the lift, because of the severity of the deterioration, the porch didn't go up.

Ms. Glenn – Also the porch is not really attached.

Ms. Kelson – And I guess what should have happened at a bare minimum is once there was some level of determination from your crew that that porch was probably not going to be saved somebody should have contacted the Building Department so we could have sent out a representative of some sort.

Ms. Flynn – This bump out porch was not original to the original building.

- Lifted the building three feet.
- Roofline has been preserved.
- Foundation is still there.

Ms. Kelson – Do you want to take down what remains of that brick?

Ms. Glenn – No. We just want to rebuild exactly as in the outline on that foundation and reconfigure the windows. Take the original lines and move them out.

Ms. Kelson – When you originally submitted your design plans you contemplated that as still being usable space for the building. It would be to your detriment not to have that space at all?

Sister Sharon – Yes.

Mr. King – I am concerned because it is a porch and by reducing the windows which are the nature of a porch. It is no longer going to be a porch. Now it will just be some sort of bump. I think it would be best to maintain the outside view as an enclosed porch.

Ms. Kelson – You can still use the space for office space. It's just that if someone was walking past and didn't know what the building was being used for, visually would say that was an enclosed porch.

Ms. Glenn – We just thought it would be preferable to pick up the original line of the windows.

Mr. King – It should be obvious that it is an add on.

There was no one present to speak for or against this application.

The public hearing was completed on January 8, 2008.

Mr. King – The ventilated porch is a nice idea.

A motion to approve the application was made by Mr. King and seconded by Ms. Basch.

The motion was approved with a vote of 5-0.

**AR 2008-03**

**267 Liberty Street**

To install a new bitumen roofing system; repair wood trim and cornice with material in kind; repoint all masonry as required; install new aluminum clad wood windows with two over two sashes; install a new six panel wood door with new transom above; install new metal railing on existing front staircase. Colors to be used – window trim and cornice base (BM Monroe Bisque HC-26) – cornice brackets, panels and molding (BM Stratton Blue HC-142) – accent trim (BM Hale Navy HC-154). Masonry body to remain unpainted and wood door to remain natural wood.

**Applicant: Richard Gilbert**

The Chairman of the Board then opened the Public Hearing by reading the text of the notice.

Anthony Coppola appeared before the board.

Mr. Coppola explained the project to the board. This is a renovation. Four level building. Single family. Interior condition rough. Floors have collapsed. Shell is intact. All aluminum clad wood windows two over two. Steps are intact – just repair. Wrought iron handrail on each side. Masonry has never been painted so will not be painted – repointed and cleaned. Cornice will need to be rebuilt. Repair slate on mansard. Full restoration.

Ms. Flynn – Questioned lower level entrance door.

Mr. Coppola – Yes, we are showing one. It will have no windows. A molded six panel door.

Ms. Crabb – Colors?

Mr. Coppola – Colors are on the drawings. The only painting will be on the wood.

Mr. Flynn – On the drawings here it says wood exterior doors to remain natural wood.

Mr. Coppola – That is the front door.

Ms. Flynn – Is there a door there already?

Mr. Coppola – No. It will be a wood six panel door. It will be painted.

There was no one present to speak for or against this application.

The public hearing was completed on January 8, 2008.

A motion to approve the application was made by Mr. King and seconded by Ms. Stevens.

The motion was approved with a vote of 5-0.

Public portion of meeting adjourned at 8:50 p.m.

A motion to enter into Executive Session was made by Ms. Flynn and seconded by Ms. Crabb.

Motion was approved with a vote of 5-0.

Respectfully submitted,

Nancy Evans

Secretary